

## 4.0 ASSOCIATED PROPERTY TYPES AND REGISTRATION REQUIREMENTS

The influences and trends that encouraged the development of specific property types are identified and included in the preceding historic context (Section 3.0). In this section, the property types found in the APE are defined and linked to associated themes (Industry and Commerce, Religion, and Residential Architecture) and a list of character-defining elements or features is included for all property types. A discussion of the applicability of the National Register Criteria and the seven aspects of integrity is provided for each of the themes.

### 4.1 Commerce

#### 4.1.1 Previous Context Work

Previous context work on this topic relevant to the APE includes: *Historic Context for Evaluation of Commercial Roadside Architecture* (Rossin and Bowers 1992), “Historic Properties of Claymont, DE,” *Scenic and Historic Highway Application for Philadelphia Pike, Brandywine Hundred* (CHAD UDel 2007), and *More than Just a Pair of Red Pumps: Preserving Historic Gas Stations* (Puleo 2001).

#### 4.1.2 Associated Property Types

Two service stations in the APE (N14542 and N09455) are associated with highway transportation as they served as filling stations, service stations, and also offered related services such as ice, auto parts, and auto sales. These two properties are related to the development of the automobile and date to the 1880 to 1940± historic period. The buildings are located on the northwest side of Philadelphia Pike and are on each side of the intersection of Commonwealth Avenue along what is now a primarily commercial strip of properties from the twentieth century.

There are no historic commercial districts in the APE. Commercial districts, or areas where a number of commercial properties exist within close proximity to one another, tend to form in a linear pattern along roadways outside of towns or around intersections where they could serve both local residents and travelers.

#### Automobile Repair and Sales

In order to be seen as significant as an example of a service station, a resource should possess the following as well as integrity from the period of significance:

- Retention of roadside location;
- Retention of roadside signage;
- Retention of gas pumps in front of building adjacent to roadway, often sheltered by a canopy or porte-cochere;
- Separation of office from auto repair facility; usually corner office with adjacent garage bays;
- Retention of original fenestration;
- Continuation under commercial use; and
- Retention of features that influenced integrity of setting, including sight lines, property boundaries, curb cuts, traffic circulation patterns, and accessibility to the roadway it served. (Puleo 2001:109-111)

#### 4.1.3 *Registration Requirements for Properties with Commercial Significance* Evaluation Criteria

The *Historic Context for the Evaluation of Commercial Roadside Architecture* (Rosin and Bowers 1992) provides general eligibility characteristics for commercial roadside architecture during the period in which the two properties in the APE were constructed. The context states:

In general, properties qualifying under this context should illustrate...commercial activity that occurred in direct response to automobile use and travel. Qualifying properties should feature site layouts that facilitate service to customers arriving by car, such as motor courts or parking lots. (Rossin and Bowers 1992:24)

The nomination provides the following guidance for the evaluation of roadside architecture specific to the National Register criteria:

Under Criterion A (properties associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of history), eligible properties should be associated with patterns of settlement and development that occurred in response to the automobile. This includes the development of secondary commercial districts along newly constructed state highways.

Under Criterion B (properties associated with the lives of persons significant in our past), eligible properties should be associated with a particular individual or family who was significantly involved with the development of commercial architecture. This might include an influential owner of a series of such facilities.

Under Criterion C (properties that embody a type, period or method of construction), eligible properties should embody the architecture of the automobile era. This includes early, traditional designs for service stations, tourist cabins and motels, as well as later, streamlined designs or buildings that exhibit identifiable traits of specific companies that developed or flourished during the automobile era. Properties that exhibit the use of modern construction techniques and materials, such as enameled porcelain, stainless steel, aluminum, and glass blocks, would also qualify under this Criterion.

Under Criterion D (properties that have yielded or may be likely to yield information), eligible properties will include those standing buildings and archaeological sites that have the potential to yield information about construction technology that otherwise could not be gleaned from documentary sources. (Rossin and Bowers 1992:25-26)

#### Aspects of Integrity

The *Historic Context for Evaluation of Commercial Roadside Architecture* provides the following information specific for evaluating integrity of commercial resources:

The association with the automobile as seen in a property's *location* and *setting* are intrinsically important to roadside architecture. The property should be located

with direct access to an improved roadway in a setting that incorporates the automobile as evidenced by a drive court and/or on-premises parking.

The original *design* of a property should be visible in the plan and form of the building(s), and the property's original *materials* should be intact. This includes framing, exterior wall sheathing and the rhythm and size of openings, as well as the details and quality of *workmanship* that went into the original construction. Similarly, building interiors should retain original elements, including fixtures, tilework, and woodwork, and the original plan should be unaltered. The removal of original details and the application of new materials weaken the property's integrity of materials and workmanship. Likewise, structural additions and removals weaken a property's integrity of design. Only if alterations were made prior to 1961 can they be considered historic. The property's original function (service station, auto show room) should be identifiable, as should the company if the property belonged to an architecturally standardized chain (such as a Texaco or Gulf gas station).

The historic *feeling* of a property is extremely subjective to characterize and more accurately reflects an amalgamation of the aforementioned characteristics in varying degrees. While a pre-1961 service station that is still functioning may retain its setting and plan, it may have been significantly remodeled and expanded so that its original appearance (including design, materials, and workmanship) is no longer discernable.

A property's *association* with an important person or event would typically be derived from the overall building or site plan as well as any architectural details that are particularly unique to that individual or occurrence. An example might include the unique design or signage of a service station owned by an important individual or designed by a prominent architect if the building exhibits those features that are associated specifically with the individual. (Rossin and Bowers 1992:25-26)

For automobile repair, sales, and service stations that continue under historic use, replacement of the original roadside signage and the associated gas pumps may not be seen as a sufficient loss of integrity to deny National Register eligibility under Criterion A. Replacement signage and pumps would need to remain in the location of the historic features so that integrity of setting and feeling of the station would not be affected.

## **4.2 Religion**

### *4.2.1 Previous Context Work*

Previous context work on this topic relevant to the APE was not identified. The following guidelines are based directly on the *National Register Bulletin: How to Apply the National Register Criteria for Evaluation* (NPS 1997).

#### 4.2.2 *Associated Property Types*

Within the APE, the Holy Rosary Church Complex (N01217) is associated with religion, particularly as religious buildings follow settlement trends and demographic changes, and dating to the 1940 to present historic period. The Holy Rosary complex includes a convent, church, rectory, and a school on more than 17 acres of land on the southeast side of Philadelphia Pike, across from Overlook Colony and the intersection of Commonwealth Avenue.

#### Religious Complex

In order to be seen as a significant example of a religious complex, a resource should possess the following as well as integrity from the period of significance:

- Combination of building functions including a church, plus two or more of the following: convent, rectory, school, parish hall, and dormitories;
- Related sites, such as cemeteries or the site of former churches;
- Related landscape features, such as prayer gardens, church yards, recreational areas (baseball fields), and playgrounds;
- Cohesive design of buildings in material, style, and/or form;
- Use of traditional church architecture style and forms, such as Gothic Revival or Colonial Revival; and
- Continuation under religious or community use.

#### 4.2.3 *Registration Requirements for Properties with Religion Significance*

##### Evaluation Criteria

Under Criterion Consideration A for religious properties, a church complex must be significant primarily for architectural distinction or historical importance. A religious property can be eligible under Criterion A for any of three reasons:

- It is significant under a theme in the history of religion having secular scholarly recognition; or
- It is significant under another historical theme, such as exploration, settlement, social philanthropy, or education; or
- It is significantly associated with traditional cultural values. (National Park Service 1997)

Under Criterion A (properties associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of history), eligible properties should be directly associated with either a specific event or a broad pattern in the history of religion. A religious property would also qualify if it were significant for its associations that illustrate the importance of a particular religious group in the social, cultural, economic, or political history of the area. This includes the development of new residential communities and changes in demographics such as an influx of immigrants.

Under Criterion B (properties associated with the lives of persons significant in our past), a religious property can be eligible for association with a person important in religious history, if that significance has scholarly, secular recognition or is important in other historic contexts. Individuals who would likely be considered significant are those who formed or significantly influenced an important religious institution or movement, or who were important in the social,

economic, or political history of the area. Properties associated with individuals important only within the context of a single congregation and lacking importance in any other historic context would not be eligible under Criterion B.

Under Criterion C (properties that embody a type, period, or method of construction), eligible properties should be evaluated in the same manner as other properties under Criterion C; that is, they should be evaluated within an established architectural context and, if necessary, compared to other properties of similar type, period, or method of construction.

Under Criterion D (properties that have yielded or may be likely to yield information), a property can be considered eligible if it can yield important information about the religious practices of a cultural group or other historic themes. This kind of property should be evaluated in the same manner as other properties under Criterion D, in relation to similar properties, other information sources, and existing data gaps.

#### Aspects of Integrity

The *National Register Bulletin: How to Apply the National Register Criteria for Evaluation* (NPS 1997) provides the following information specific for evaluating integrity of religious properties. As with all eligible properties, religious properties must physically represent the period of time for which they are significant. For instance, a recent building that houses an older congregation cannot qualify based on the historic activities of the group because the current building does not convey the earlier history. Likewise, an older building that housed the historic activities of the congregation is eligible if it still physically represents the period of the congregation's significance. However, if an older building has been remodeled to the extent that its appearance dates from the time of the remodeling, it can only be eligible if the period of significance corresponds with the period of the alterations. The aspects of integrity that must be retained for a religious property to be determined eligible depend on the area of significance. For instance, integrity of design, materials, and workmanship must be retained for a church to be determined eligible as a significant example of an architectural style.

### **4.3 Architecture**

This section introduces and describes the most architectural types and forms evident in the built environment of the APE as property types and identifies their typical characteristics. Criteria for evaluating architectural properties in the APE is based largely on the following previous context and regional guides:

- *Suburbanization in the Vicinity of Wilmington, Delaware, 1880-1950+/-: A Historic Context* (Chase et al. 1992); and
- *Everyday Architecture of the Mid-Atlantic* (Lanier and Herman 1997b).

Supplemental information on national trends is taken from the following style guides: *A Field Guide to American Houses* (McAlester and McAlester 1998) and *American Architecture 1860-1976* (Whiffen and Kopner 2001).

#### 4.3.1 *Associated Property Types*

All residential resources in the APE date to the historic periods 1880 to 1940± and 1940 to present. The resources are all generally associated with the suburbanization of the Wilmington area's first through industrial communities and later through streetcar and automobile suburbs.

Beyond Holy Rosary Church, which is Late Gothic Revival style, there are no examples of high-style architecture within the APE. Several resources in the APE reflect some architectural detailing of popular styles but are not examples of fully elaborate forms. All of the residential buildings in the APE can be characterized as vernacular. (Note: The dwellings within Overlook Colony are located outside of the APE). A discussion of the bungalow form and the Late Gothic Revival Style registration requirements is provided below.

#### Vernacular Architecture

Vernacular architecture is a term that refers to buildings and structures that were built in a functional manner, sometimes using indigenous materials, with little to no stylistic embellishment. Vernacular buildings are those that were erected without the benefit of architects' plans.

Vernacular dwellings typically appear as common house forms or plans. Occasionally, minimal stylistic detailing is included on these forms and plans, often representing a greatly simplified interpretation of a higher style example.

Within the APE, the bungalow at 3220 Philadelphia Pike and the Holy Rosary rectory are of early-twentieth-century vernacular housing forms. Vernacular dwellings in the APE would most appropriately be evaluated under Criterion A for their reflections of trends or patterns in history. Under Criterion C, a vernacular dwelling would need to embody the characteristics of a vernacular type popular in New Castle County, the region, or Delaware to retain strong integrity of design and materials and to be one of the better-preserved examples of its type in the APE or the surrounding area.

Bungalow. The bungalow dwelling type was very popular in Delaware between the 1910s and the 1930s, and several examples can be seen in the Claymont area. The bungalow's low cost, versatility, and ease of construction all contributed to its proliferation (Chase, Ames, and Siders 1992:40). Most bungalows in Delaware were constructed in multiple numbers or alongside other popular housing forms of the twentieth century (i.e., Foursquares) in new suburbs that developed in and around urban areas in the first quarter of the twentieth century.

In order to be seen as a significant example of a bungalow, a resource must possess the following as well as exceptional integrity from the period of significance:

- Typically one and one-half stories;
- Low-pitched gable or hipped roof with wide, overhanging eaves; gable usually faces street; often with dormer windows;
- Three bays wide with central entrance;
- Roof rafters usually exposed; decorative beams or braces are visible under gables;

- One-story integral porch, often supported by massive, short, battered square columns or piers; column bases generally extend to ground level without breaking at level of porch floor;
- Wood shingle siding is most common; stone, brick, stucco, and rusticated concrete block are also used;
- Exterior chimney, generally constructed of rough masonry; and
- Varied window openings, including bay windows and often small windows flanking chimney at side elevation. (Chase et al. 1992:40; Lanier and Herman 1997b:180)

### High Style Architecture

Late Gothic Revival. The Late Gothic Revival style (1900 to 1940) developed out of the ecclesiastical work of Boston architect Ralph Adams Cram (1863 to 1942) in the early twentieth century and was widely used in the construction of ecclesiastical structures. It was also less commonly utilized by designers of education and commercial buildings. Collegiate Gothic is a term used to describe buildings similar in style to those found at Bryn Mawr College. The style is more true to its European origins than the previous Gothic Revival periods in American architectural history. The historical basis for the style was the Late Gothic architecture of England and France.

In order to be seen as a significant example of the Late Gothic Revival style, a resource must possess most of the following as well as exceptional integrity from the period of significance:

- Fine materials and craftsmanship, usually stone, brick, or tile;
- Steeply pitched cross gable roofs;
- Overall monumentality;
- Variety of window types and treatments, including Gothic-inspired arch windows, rose windows, leaded glass windows, and window tracery;
- Horizontal bands of stone molding; and
- Tudor arch doors. (Whiffen and Kopner 2001)

Churches executed in this style typically feature asymmetrical floor plans and castellated towers and/or pinnacles, sometimes with crockets.

For Late Gothic Revival complexes, such as churches and colleges, it is commonplace to have cohesive, balanced compositions of buildings with multiple but related functions (Whiffen and Kopner 2001:286-292).

#### *4.3.2 Registration Requirements for Properties with Residential Architectural Significance*

##### Evaluation Criteria

The features for determining whether individual resources are eligible for listing in the National Register under the residential architecture context are primarily physical and usually apply to the resources' eligibilities under Criterion C. To be eligible under Criterion C in the area of architecture, a property must include a building or structure that embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction, as outlined in the property type discussion. A dwelling may represent the characteristics or construction methods of an architectural style or form of vernacular architecture popular in New Castle County, the region,

or Delaware in a given period. Individual buildings must possess strong integrity of design and materials to be eligible under Criterion C.

A property can also be eligible under Criterion C if it represents the work of a master. A master is generally recognized as an individual known for greatness in a field or an anonymous craftsman whose work is distinguishable from others by its characteristic style and quality. The work of the master would need to clearly exceed the level of workmanship of other properties identified in Brandywine Hundred or New Castle County.

To be eligible under Criterion A, a dwelling must have originally, or through much of its history, been associated with and be reflective of a trend or pattern in history. Residential dwellings would likely be eligible under Criterion A for trends or patterns in history such as industrial communities, subdivisions, and demographic changes.

To be eligible under Criterion B in the area of architecture, a dwelling must be associated with the productive life of an individual who has played a role in the historic development and/or prosperity of the area, state, or nation. The continued occupation of a dwelling by the same family over a number of generations may be significant under Criterion A, not Criterion B, since it would be reflective of a pattern of ownership rather than the accomplishments of an individual.

To be eligible under Criterion D in the area of architecture, the dwelling fabric must possess the potential to yield information on building practices or methods of construction not available in any other way or the property must possess archaeological potential. Eligibility of aboveground resources under Criterion D is rare; generally only an extremely well-preserved example of a dwelling style, form, or construction method with significant historical documentation that has the potential to answer important resource questions would be eligible under Criterion D. If a dwelling is a rare example of a method of construction, and could yield information on construction techniques, it may not require as high a degree of integrity as other residential dwellings.

#### Aspects of Integrity

Residential architecture resources must retain a minimum of four of the seven aspects of integrity to be considered eligible: integrity of design, materials, workmanship, location, setting, feeling and association.

Integrity of *design* is most critical when evaluating individual resources as representative examples of a type under Criterion C. For buildings and structures, design refers to massing, fenestration, ornamentation, and other architectural qualities. Integrity of building design would be compromised on the exterior through incompatible additions as well as the loss of at least two of the five major architectural elements (rooflines, windows, doors, chimneys, and porches).

Integrity of *materials* is the retention of those physical elements of construction used to create buildings, structures, and features. The cladding of original siding with historic-period replacement siding (clapboards or asbestos shingles) may be acceptable if the cladding is in character with the original materials, and the building retains its original design, form, and massing. While replacement windows and/or doors may have been installed in a building, the

original fenestration pattern should remain. Dwellings that have poor integrity of materials will generally not be individually eligible; however, they may still be eligible as contributing elements in historic districts.

Additive changes are often clearly identifiable as products of a particular period or value of the owner and do not necessarily compromise integrity. When assessing integrity of materials, it is important to identify if the changes were made during the period of significance and why they were made. One question to ask is: Do the material changes reveal important aspects of the history and evolution of the property, such as changing trends in agriculture or cultural values, or do they detract from the overall integrity of the property?

Integrity of *workmanship* is physical evidence of functional and/or decorative craftsmanship during a given period in history. Examples of workmanship in the study area include decorative woodworking and brickwork. When materials or methods are replaced, evidence of workmanship is either masked or lost.

*Location* is defined as the place where a historic-period building was constructed. Dwellings that have been relocated and retain integrity of materials, design, and workmanship would still be eligible under this context. National Register Criteria Consideration B states that a property that has been removed from its original or historically significant location may be eligible if it is significant primarily for its architectural value or as the extant property most associated with a historic person or event.

*Setting* is defined as the physical environment of a dwelling. Integrity of setting is most critical for those properties being recommended eligible under Criterion A in the area of Settlement Patterns and Demographic Change. For those residential resources that are eligible under Criterion C in the area of architecture, integrity of setting is not critical.

*Feeling* is a property's ability to express the aesthetic sense of a particular time and place in history, or its historic-period character. The cumulative effect of integrity of setting, design, materials, and workmanship creates a sense, or feeling, of the past.

*Association* is the direct link between a property and the important events and persons that shaped it. For those buildings associated with the development and growth of Claymont, associations between the buildings and important suburban features such as landscaping, roadways, and cohesive design of nearby houses must be demonstrated through physical features of the setting and landscape.